

Environment and Sustainability Committee

Meeting Venue: **Committee Room 3 – Senedd**

Meeting date: **Thursday, 26 March 2015**

Meeting time: **09.30 – 11.30**

This meeting can be viewed on [Senedd TV](http://senedd.tv/en/2713) at:
<http://senedd.tv/en/2713>

Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales



Concise Minutes:

MeetingTitle

Assembly Members:

Alun Ffred Jones AM (Chair)
David Rees AM (In place of Mick Antoniw AM)
Jeff Cuthbert AM
Russell George AM
Llyr Gruffydd AM
Julie Morgan AM
William Powell AM
Jenny Rathbone AM
Paul Davies AM (In place of Antoinette Sandbach AM)
Joyce Watson AM

Witnesses:

Carl Sargeant AM, The Minister for Natural Resources
Sarah Dawson, Welsh Government
Neil Hemington, Welsh Government
Tony Clark, Welsh Government
Graham Rees, Welsh Government
Matthew Quinn, Welsh Government

Committee Staff:

Alun Davidson (Clerk)
Catherine Hunt (Second Clerk)
Peter Hill (Deputy Clerk)

TRANSCRIPT

View the [meeting transcript](#).

1 Introductions, apologies and substitutions

Apologies were received from Antoinette Sandbach and Mick Antoniw. Paul Davies and David Rees attended as a substitute.

2 Planning (Wales) Bill: Stage 2 – Consideration of amendments

In accordance with Standing Order 26.21, the Committee disposed of the following amendments to the Bill:

Amendment 74 (William Powell) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 75 (William Powell) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 76 (William Powell) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 77 (William Powell) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 78 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
William Powell	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Paul Davies	
	Russell George	
	Llyr Gruffydd	
	Julie Morgan	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	David Rees	
	Joyce Watson	
1	8	0
Amendment 78 was not agreed		

Amendment 115 (Russell George)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Llyr Gruffydd	
	Julie Morgan	
	William Powell	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	David Rees	
	Joyce Watson	
2	7	0
Amendment 115 was not agreed		

Amendment 191 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 191 was not agreed.		

Amendment 79 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 79 was not agreed.		

Amendment 80 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 80 was not agreed.		

Amendment 57 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 116 (Russell George)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 116 was not agreed.		

Amendment 41 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 192 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 192 was not agreed.

Amendment 193 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 193 was not agreed.

Amendment 117 (Russell George)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 117 was not agreed.

Amendment 86 (Russell George)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Llyr Gruffydd	
	Julie Morgan	
	William Powell	
	Jenny Rathbone	

	David Rees	
	Joyce Watson	
2	7	0
Amendment 86 was not agreed.		

Amendment 194 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 194 was not agreed.		

Amendment 195 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 195 was not agreed.		

Amendment 196 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	

William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 196 was not agreed.		

Amendment 197 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 197 was not agreed.		

Amendment 58 (Carl Sargeant) was not moved.

Amendment 59 (Carl Sargeant) was not moved.

Amendment 81 (William Powell) was not moved.

Amendment 5 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Jeff Cuthbert	Paul Davies	
Julie Morgan	Russell George	
Jenny Rathbone	Llyr Gruffydd	
David Rees	Alun Ffred Jones	
Joyce Watson	William Powell	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 5 was not agreed.		

Amendment 6 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Jeff Cuthbert	Paul Davies	
Julie Morgan	Russell George	
Jenny Rathbone	Llyr Gruffydd	
David Rees	Alun Ffred Jones	
Joyce Watson	William Powell	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 6 was not agreed.		

Amendment 82 (William Powell) was not moved.

Amendment 198 (Llyr Gruffydd) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 199 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 199 was not agreed.		

Amendment 200 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	

William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 200 was not agreed.		

Amendment 201 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 201 was not agreed.		

Amendment 7 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 8 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 9 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 60 (Carl Sargeant) was not moved.

Amendment 10 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 202 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative		

(in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 202 was not agreed.

Amendment 203 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 203 was not agreed.

Amendment 204 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 204 was not agreed.

Amendment 205 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 205 was not agreed.

Amendment 11 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 12 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 13 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 14 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 15 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 16 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 17 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 18 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 19 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 20 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 21 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 22 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 118 (Russell George)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 118 was not

agreed.

Amendment 119 (Russell George)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 119 was not agreed.

Amendment 120 (Russell George)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 120 was not agreed.

Amendment 42 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 121 (Russell George)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 121 was not agreed.

Amendment 43 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 23 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 24 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 25 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 83 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 83 was not agreed.		

Amendment 55 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 26 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 84 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Paul Davies	Jeff Cuthbert	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Llyr Gruffydd	Jenny Rathbone	
Alun Ffred Jones	David Rees	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative		

(in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 84 was not agreed.

Amendment 27 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 28 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i)

Amendment 44 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Jeff Cuthbert	Paul Davies	
Julie Morgan	Russell George	
Jenny Rathbone	Llyr Gruffydd	
David Rees	Alun Ffred Jones	
Joyce Watson	William Powell	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 44 was not agreed.		

Amendment 56 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

3 Minister for Natural Resources: Financial scrutiny session

The Minister and officials responded to questions from members of the Committee.

The Minister for Natural Resources agreed to:

- Provide the Committee with a profile of the projected savings resulting from the creation of Natural Resources Wales;
- Update the Committee on whether the £3.9 million allocated to the Nature Fund in 2014-15 will be spent; and
- Provide a note on the role that stakeholders have played in developing the Wales data hub.

4 Papers to note

4.1 Correspondence from the Minister for Natural Resources

Members noted the correspondence.

4.2 Correspondence from the Deputy Minister for Farming and Food

Members noted the correspondence.

4.3 Marine policy in Wales: Correspondence from Natural Resources Wales

Members noted the correspondence.

4.4 Natural Resources Wales annual scrutiny: Correspondence from Emyr Roberts

Members noted the correspondence.